

Information note to the Press
(Press Release No.42 /2009/QoS)
Telecom Regulatory Authority of India

For Immediate release

Tel. No.:011-23230404
Fax: 011-23213036
E-mail: advqos@traf.gov.in
Website: www.traf.gov.in

TRAI Releases Report of the independent agencies engaged for the Objective Assessment of Quality of Service and Customer Satisfaction Survey of Telecom Services in Andhra Pradesh service area.

New Delhi, 12th May, 2009 - TRAI engaged M/s. IMRB International as independent agency for (1) conducting an objective assessment of the Quality of Service provided by basic and cellular mobile telephone service providers and broadband service providers and (2) Subjective customer satisfaction surveys for assessing the customers' perception of the service and to assess the implementation and effectiveness of Telecom Consumers Protection and Redressal of Grievances Regulations, 2007.

2. Key Findings of the independent agency on Quality of Service

Telecom service providers are not meeting Customer satisfaction benchmark. The Authority demands better treatment to the customers particularly in resolving the grievances of customers by the service providers. TRAI carried out a customer satisfaction survey through M/s. IMRB for Andhra Pradesh service area during the period from October 2008 - February, 2009. The survey covered 6409 mobile subscribers, 4260 fixed line subscribers and 7516 broadband subscribers across the various districts/ cities of Andhra Pradesh service area spread across various geographies and customer strata.

2.1 Proportion of satisfied customers on various customer service perception parameters

2.1.1 Cellular Mobile Telephone Service: In Andhra Pradesh service area the survey of customers satisfaction of service of service providers, namely, Bharti-Airtel, Vodafone, Idea Cellular, BSNL, Reliance Communications and Tata Teleservices was conducted. The gradation on "Satisfaction" score i.e. scores of "Very Satisfied" and "Satisfied" is given in Table-1 below. The survey results reveal that there is a need to improve the satisfaction level of subscribers with respect to the Help services, Network Performance, Maintainability, Supplementary services and also Overall Satisfaction across the service providers.

Table-1 {Cellular Mobile Telephone Service – Andhra Pradesh Service Area}

Name of Service Providers (Sample Size)	Percentage (%) Customers Satisfied With							
	Provision of service	Billing Performance		Help Services	Network Performance	Maintainability	Supplementary Services	Overall Satisfaction
		Post paid	Prepaid					
Bharti Airtel (1103)	98	100	99	93	94	94	95	92
Vodafone (1058)	98	92	99	92	93	92	92	89
Idea (1073)	97	93	98	91	94	94	94	91
BSNL (1056)	90	97	96	80	81	81	81	78
RCOM (1061)	96	94	100	89	92	91	92	86
Tata (1058)	98	94	99	92	93	92	92	90

Note: Shaded areas indicates areas of significant weakness

Source: TRAI survey carried out by M/s IMRB based on sample of 6409 subscribers

2.1.2 Basic Telephone Service (wire line): In Andhra Pradesh service area the survey of customer's satisfaction of services of service provider M/s Bharti Airtel, BSNL, RCOM and Tata Teleservices was conducted. The gradation on "Satisfaction" score i.e. scores of "Very Satisfied" and "Satisfied" is given in Table-2 below. The survey results reveal that there is a need to improve the satisfaction level of subscribers with respect to Service Provisioning, Help services, Network Performance, Maintainability and also Overall Satisfaction across the service providers.

Table-2 {Basic Telephone Service – Andhra Pradesh Service Area}

Name of Service Providers (Sample Size)	Percentage (%) Customers Satisfied With							
	Provision of service	Billing Performance		Help Services	Network Performance	Maintainability	Supplementary Services	Overall Satisfaction
		Post paid	Prepaid					
Bharti Airtel (1060)	91	97	-	76	94	36	-	84
BSNL (1083)	92	96	-	87	88	71	68	88
RCOM (1078)	91	96	93	88	91	81	-	88
TATA (1039)	99	98	99	87	98	94	-	95

Note: Shaded areas indicates areas of significant weakness

Source: TRAI survey carried out by M/s IMRB based on sample of 4260 subscribers

2.1.3 Broadband Service: In Andhra Pradesh service area the survey of customers' satisfaction of service of service providers, namely, BSNL, Bharti Airtel, RCOM, TATA, Sify, Hathway and You Telecom was conducted. The gradation on "Satisfaction" score i.e. scores of "Very Satisfied" and "Satisfied" is given in Table-3 below. The survey results reveal that there is a need to improve the satisfaction level of subscribers with respect to the Help services, Network Performance and Supplementary Services including Overall Satisfaction across the service providers.

Table-3 {Broadband Service–Andhra Pradesh service area}

Name of Service Providers (Sample Size)	Percentage (%) Customers Satisfied With							
	Provision of service	Billing Performance		Help Services	Network Performance	Maintainability	Supplementary Services	Overall Satisfaction
		Post paid	Prepaid					
Airtel (1091)	99	93	95	70	90	95	71	83
BSNL (1075)	98	98	96	76	87	90	81	79
RCOM (1068)	100	97	98	81	85	91	55	76
TATA (VSNL) (1072)	99	97	97	69	90	93	76	79
Sify (1075)	95	96	94	62	82	87	51	68
You Telecom (1070)	98	94	99	85	84	93	91	70
Hathway (1065)	98	94	98	64	79	92	48	71

Note: Shaded areas indicates areas of significant weakness

Source: TRAI survey carried out by M/s IMRB based on sample of 7516 subscribers

2.2 Objective Assessment/Audit of Quality of Service performance

2.2.1 Cellular Mobile Telephone Service: In Andhra Pradesh service area the audit of quality of service data of service providers, namely, Reliance Communications, Vodafone, Idea, Tata Teleservices, Bharti Airtel, and BSNL was conducted. The audit for Cellular Mobile Telephone Service Providers was conducted at their respective MSCs in the Andhra Pradesh circle apart from Reliance Communication whose audit was conducted at their central NOC, Mumbai. Service Provider's performance in respect of cellular mobile telephone service based on one month data is given in Annex-'1'. The areas of concerns i.e. parameters, for which benchmarks is not met by the service providers are identified based on analysis of one month QoS performance data and live measurement as below:

- TCH Congestion
- Percentage calls answered by the operator

2.2.1.1 Drive Test: The operator assisted drive tests were conducted in Hyderabad, Vijaywada and Warangal to verify parameters like Call Drop Rate, Call Set-up Success Rate, Blocked Call Rate and Percentage of Connections with Good Voice Quality. The areas of concerns (i.e. parameters) are identified as below:

- Blocked Call Rate
- Connections with good voice quality

The independent drive test was conducted in Hyderabad to verify parameters like Call Drop Rate, Call Set-up Success Rate, Blocked Call Rate and Percentage of Connections with Good Voice Quality. The areas of concerns (i.e. parameters) are identified as below:

- Call set up success rate
- Blocked Call Rate
- Call drop rate
- Connections with good voice quality

2.2.2 Basic Service (wire line) : In Andhra Pradesh service area the audit of quality of service data of basic service provider, Bharti-Airtel, BSNL, RCOM and TATA was conducted. Basic Service (Wire line) audit for Andhra Pradesh circle broadly indicates that the service provider is not meeting the benchmarks for some of the Parameters. The performance in respect of basic service (wire line) based on one month data is given in Annex-`2'. The areas of concerns i.e. parameters, for which benchmarks is not met by the service provider, is identified based on analysis of one month QoS performance data and live measurement as below:

- Mean Time to Repair (MTTR)
- Fault repaired within 24 hrs

2.2.3 Broadband Service : In Andhra Pradesh service area the audit of quality of service data of service providers, namely, Bharti Airtel, BSNL, RCOM, VSNL, You Telecom, Hathway and Sify were conducted by independent agency M/s. IMRB International. The audit for Broadband Service Providers was conducted at their respective network operating centre/point of presence (POPs) in the Andhra Pradesh circle. Service Provider's performance based on one month data is given in Annex - `3'. The area of concern i.e. parameter, for which benchmark is not met by the service provider, is identified based on analysis of one month QoS performance data and live measurement as below:

- Faults repaired within 24 hours

3. Telecom Consumers Protection and Redressal of Grievances score: The results of the survey reveal that 59.4% of cellular mobile telephone, 72% of Basic and 88.5% of Broadband customers claimed to be aware of the Call Centre while the awareness of nodal officer and appellate authority for redressing grievances is quite low. 62% of the Cellular mobile telephone service customers, 60% of basic telephone service customers, and 54% of Broadband customers who had lodged complaints said that they were satisfied with the system of resolving their complaints by the call centres. Service providers need to take effective steps for bringing awareness about three stage redressal mechanism including contact details of Nodal Officers/ appellate authority to improve customers satisfaction.

4. Value Added Services: The Authority had entrusted the survey agency to undertake survey about the provision of value added services without explicit consent by all the service providers. The reports of the survey agency reveal the

following position about provision of value added services without explicit consent of the consumers;-

Question: Did the service provider have your explicit consent before providing the chargeable value added service such as ring tone, emails / GPRS, voice mail etc. ?					
Name of Service Provider	Total customer surveyed, who have given specific response	Yes		No	
		Count	%age	Count	%age
Airtel	279	163	58.4	114	40.9
Vodafone	214	167	78	44	20.6
Idea	259	175	67.6	77	29.7
BSNL	162	101	62.3	56	34.6
RCOM	218	144	66.1	70	32.1
TATA	171	121	70.8	49	28.7
Total	1303	871	66.8	410	31.5

5. The survey revealed that 31.5% customers were provided value added services without their explicit consent. It is also revealed that most of the service providers have considerably higher number of such responses of provisioning of Value added service without explicit consent of the customers.

6. ***The detailed Report on Quality of Service – Audit/Objective Assessment and Customer Satisfaction Survey, including grievance redressal mechanism, conducted during the period October, 2008 to February, 2009 is placed at TRAI Website (www.trai.gov.in).***

Contact Address in case any clarification required:

M.C.Chaube,
Advisor (QOS), TRAI
Mahanagar Door Sanchar Bhawan,
Jawahar Lal Nehru Marg (Old Minto Road),
New Delhi -110002, Tel. No. 23230404/23220708

Authorized to issue: Advisor (QOS)

Service provider performance report based on one month verification:

Cellular Mobile Services

Parameters	Benchmark	RCOM	Vodafone	IDEA	TATA	Bharti Airtel	BSNL
Accumulated downtime for community isolation	< 24 hrs.	0.00	6.37	10.18	0.00	7.77	19.40
Call Set Up Success Rate (CSSR)	> 95%	99.54%	98.04%	99.75%	98.54%	96.94%	98.00%
Service Access Delay*	9 to 20 seconds (< = 15 seconds for 100 calls)	5.00	10.00	8.00	8.00	9.60	7.10
Blocked Call Rate							
SDCCH /Paging Channel Congestion	<1%	0.00%	0.10%	0.39%	0.00%	0.80%	0.48%
TCH Congestion	< 2%	0.45%	0.12%	0.68%	0.06%	1.87%	2.31%
Call drop rate	< 3%	0.56%	1.05%	0.89%	0.80%	1.57%	1.83%
Percentage connections with good voice quality*	> 95%	99.58%	96.89%	97.14%	97.64%	97.35%	99.18%
Service coverage*							
In door	>-75dbm	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied
In vehicle	>-85dbm						
Out door - in city	>-95dbm						
POI congestion	< 0.5%	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied
Calls answered electronically							
Percentage calls answered within 20 seconds	80%	99%	100%	DNP	100%	100%	100%
Percentage calls answered within 40 seconds	95%	99%	100%	DNP	100%	100%	100%
Calls Answered by the operator							
Percentage calls answered within 60 seconds	80%	93%	99%	DNP	91%	95%	62%
Percentage calls answered within 90 seconds	95%	96%	100%	DNP	93%	97%	72%
Billing Complaints							
Billing complaints per 100 bills issued	<0.1%	0.09%	0.06%	0.03%	0.01%	0.00%	0.00%
Percentage billing complaints resolved within 4 weeks	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%
Period of refunds/payments due to customers from the date of resolution of complaints	<4 weeks	100%	100%	100%	100%	NA	64%

*Details pertaining to these are obtained through operator assisted drive tests. Results of the drive tests are explained in greater detail in critical findings

** Methodology not in line with QoS

Figures provided on All India basis

Not meeting the benchmark

B*mark = TRAI Benchmark, DNA = Details not available

Annexure - 2

Service provider performance report based on one month verification – Basic Services (Wireline)

S.no	Parameters	B'mark	Bharti	BSNL	RCOM	TATA
1	Provision of telephone after registration of demand					
1.1	Connections completed within 7 days	100%	100%	84%	87%	95%
2	Fault incidence/clearance statistics					
3	Fault incidences(No. of faults/100 subscribers/month)	<3				
3.1	Faults repaired within 24 hours	>90%	92%	86%	99%	88%
3.2	Faults repaired within three working days	100%	100%	100%	99%	100%
4	Mean time to Repair (MTTR)	<8 hours	10.2	11.6	3.2	7.1
5	Call Completion Rate (CCR)	>55%	87%	65%	DNA	80%
6	Metering and billing credibility					
6.1	Billing complaints per 100 bills issued	<0.1%	0.62%	0.16%	0.01%	0.01%
6.2	%age of billing complaints resolved within 4 weeks	100%	99%	90%	100%	100%
7	Customer care/helpline promptness					
7.1	<u>Shift requests attended</u>					
	Shift requests attended within 3 days	95%	96%	77%	98%	84%
7.2	<u>Closure request attended</u>					
	Closure within 24 hours	95%	100%	86%	99%	100%
7.3	<u>Supplementary (additional) service requests attended</u>					
	Additional facility provided within 24 hours	95%	100%	93%	100%	97%
8	Response time to customer for assistance					
8.1	% age call answered through IVR in 20 seconds	80%	100%	47%	100%	100%
	% age call answered through IVR in 40 seconds	100%	100%	98%	100%	100%
8.2	% age calls answered by operator in 60 seconds	80%	96%	97%	97%	91%
	% age calls answered by operator in 90 seconds	95%	98%	100%	99%	93%
9	Time taken for refund of deposits after closure					
9.1	%age cases where refund received within 60 days	100%	100%	50%	100%	100%

{*Note: For BSNL data pertains to the sample 5% of exchanges audited during the period of to September to November 2008, whereas for rest of the operators figures pertain to all the exchanges present in the circle}

** Methodology not in line with QoS ■ Figures provided on All India basis ■ Not meeting the benchmark **B'mark** = TRAI Benchmark, **DNA** = Details not available

Annexure-3

Service provider performance report based on one month Verification – Broadband Services

S.No	Parameter	B'mark	Bharti	BSNL	Sify	H'way	VSNL	You Telecom	RCOM
1	Service provisioning uptime								
1.1	Total connections registered/calls made		3468	4213	816	2625	2940	1050	601
1.2	Percentage connections provided within 15 days	100%	100%	80%	100%	100%	98%	100%	99%
2	Fault repair restoration time								
2.1	Total number of faults registered/calls made		1585	2448	3299	8872	16475	730	1720
2.2	Percentage faults repaired by next working days	> 90%	93%	82%	91%	87%	94%	96%	98%
2.3	Percentage faults repaired within three working days	99%	98%	98%	100%	100%	99%	99%	100%
3	Billing performance								
3.1	Total bills generated/calls made		43587	68958	All Prepaid customers	21897	19419	29150	7924
3.2	Billing complaints per 100 bills issued	<2%	0.61%	0.08%		1.96%	0.90%	0.21%	0.08%
3.3	%age of billing complaints resolved within 4 weeks	100%	100%	77%		100%	100%	100%	100%
3.4	Time taken for refund of deposits after closure	100%	100%	92%		100%	100%	100%	100%
4	Customer care/helpline assessment								
4.1	Percentage calls answered within 60 seconds	> 60%	96%	97%	97%	100%	95%	81%	94%
4.2	Percentage calls answered within 90 seconds	>80%	98%	88%	100%	100%	97%	85%	96%
5	Bandwidth utilisation/Throughput								
5.1	Total number of intra network links tested		85	23 BRAS, TI 24, T2624,DSLAM 5960	412	0	16	NA	2
5.2	Total number if intra network links crossing 90%		0	0	0	0	0	NA	0
	Upstream Bandwidth (ISP Node to NIXI/NAP/IGSP)								
5.3	Total number of upstream links		1	141	27	5	50	4	NA
5.4	Number of links > 90%		0	8	0	1	0	0	NA
5.5	Percentage bandwidth utilised on upstream links	<80%	89%	70%	79%	90%	60%	77%	NA
6	Broadband download speed	>80%	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied	Complied
7	Service availability/uptime	>98%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	98.92%	98.22%	99.40%	99.49%
8	Packet loss	<1%	<1%	<1%	<1%	<1%	<1%		<1%
9	Network Latency								
9.1	POP/ISP Node to NIXI to IGSP	<120msec	<100	<120	Complied	<100	Complied	<50	Complied
9.2	ISP node to NAP port	<350msec	<248	Complied	Complied	<250	Complied	<300	Complied